



**SF Environment**

**Our home. Our city. Our planet.**

A Department of the City and County of San Francisco

Edwin M. Lee  
Mayor

Deborah O. Raphael  
Director

## Energy Efficiency Coordinating Committee

Monday, July 18, 2016, 3:00 p.m.  
City Hall, Room 421  
One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Jr. Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102

### MINUTES DRAFT

#### 1. Call meeting to order

The Energy Efficiency Coordinating Committee meeting was convened at 3:00 p.m. (Present: Members Avni Jamdar (President), Cal Broomhead (arrived at 3:22 p.m.), James Bryant (arrived at 3:30 p.m.), Antonio Diaz, Sam Moss (left at 4:24 p.m.), Renae Steichen, Daniel Young, Miriam Zouzounis (arrived at 3:55 p.m.); Excused: Holly Kaufman (Vice-President) and Lori Mitchell.

#### 2. Approval of minutes from June 20, 2016 Committee meeting. (Attachment: June 20, 2016 Committee meeting minutes) (Discussion and Action)

Upon motion by Member Steichen and second by Member Moss, the minutes for the May 16, 2016 Energy Efficiency Coordinating Committee were approved without objection (Aye: Members Jamdar, Diaz, Moss and Steichen; Excused: Members Bryant, Kaufman and Zouzounis)

#### 3. Discussion of energy efficiency: local policy, state policy and energy data access.

- Barry Hooper, Green Building Specialist, San Francisco Department of the Environment

Barry Hooper, Green Building Specialist, San Francisco Department of the Environment discussed the passage of the San Francisco Benchmarking and Audit Performance Ordinance for commercial buildings in 2011, voluntary green building programs, California and San Francisco Green Buildings Codes requiring energy efficiency at time of permit, the collection of data through EnergyStar online data tool, requirement for annual benchmarking and an energy audit or retrocommissioning every 5 years, benchmarked municipal facilities, benchmarking compliance by floor area, commercial use and economic growth in the last five years, SF office energy use compared to other U.S. cities, audit requirements, energy savings opportunity and audit workforce.

Member Steichen asked about possible recommendations.

Barry Hooper discussed the fact that the ordinance only applies to commercial buildings, the limits created by state policy requiring individual buy in on data sharing that limits local policies, AB 802 regarding benchmarking, urging the CPUC to change consent rules regarding obtaining information from multiple tenants both commercial and residential.

Member Jamdar asked about penetration with current funding under the ordinance.

Member Steichen asked about the possibility of expanding the Green Building Code.

Member Jamdar stated that a possible recommendation could be expanding the program to multifamily, market rate and affordable provided that people could provide their energy data.

There was no public comment on this item.

#### **4. Discussion of Pacific Gas and Electric Company programs.**

- Paola Benassi, Manager, Energy Savings Assistance Program
- Jessica Waggoner, Supervisor, EE Policy and Strategy

Jessica Waggoner, Supervisor of Energy Efficiency Policy and Strategy, Pacific Gas and Electric Company discussed PG&E rebates and incentives, direct install through Energy Watch turnkey program, CORE catalog for rebates, multifamily customers, commercial customers including small and medium business and hard-to-reach small business, marketing and outreach, achievements since 2006.

Member Bryant asked about the lack of activity in Supervisorial District 10.

Member Broomhead discussed eligibility for PG&E's multi-family program.

Jessica Waggoner discussed on bill financing, Core rebates and the Step Up and Power Down program.

Member Bryant asked about who the partners were for outreach.

Member Steichen asked about loans.

Member Moss asked about building owners being able to apply for grants for commercial storefront tenants.

Paola Benassi, Manager, Energy Savings and Assistance Program (ESAP), Pacific Gas and Electric Company discussed ESAP's history and background, eligibility, key program offerings, service by demographics, marketing outreach, program enhancements including the addition of LEDs, Smart Thermostats, Behavioral change, water savings and reserving customers who have not been contacted since 2002.

Member Bryant asked how the Committee can help ESAP do better.

Paola Benassi discussed the challenge of finding customers and reaching them.

Member Jamdar asked about the income requirements and whether or not they can be changed.

Member Steichen asked what percentage of low income residents are being served.

Member Broomhead asked what the definition of measure mix is.

Member Broomhead asked about the allowance for deferred maintenance.

Member Jamdar what is the maximum amount for overall project costs with ESAP.

Member Jamdar asked Member Broomhead how ESAP can work better with the Department of the Environment.

Member Broomhead discussed SRO hotels.

Member Jamdar asked if affordable housing developments are eligible for the program.

Member Bryant discussed public housing residents.

Member Jamdar asked about the contractors for the program.

Paola Benassi discussed the challenges of parking for contractors.

Member Jamdar asked about recommending to the CPUC that they increase the income eligibility requirement for San Francisco.

Public Comment

Eddie Ahn, Brightline Defense Project, discussed the \$424 million in ESAP funds in California that have not been spent and asked the Committee to address this matter.

Member Jamdar asked Paola Benassi to address the matter. Paola Benassi said she would send the question to the other utilities if the question came in a letter.

- 5. Discussion of San Francisco energy efficiency matrix.** The Committee is developing a document that brings together information on energy efficiency programs in San Francisco organized by sector, funding sources, populations affected, various agencies involved and jobs added. (Attachment: San Francisco Energy Efficiency Program Matrix)
- Cal Broomhead, Climate and Energy Innovation Manager, San Francisco Department of the Environment

Cal Broomhead, Climate and Energy Innovation Manager, San Francisco Department of the Environment discussed the line item for low income in multifamily and single family.

Member Steichen asked about adding the total budget for each program.

Member Broomhead said that the information can be added to the programs listed in the appendix when appropriate.

Member Zouzounis asked about a pilot program for small business.

Member Broomhead discussed pilot programs.

The Committee discussed urging the Board of Supervisors to make recommendations to the State about CPUC policies.

Member Steichen said that she would like to see more information that would be helpful in finding where the gaps are in programming.

Member Jamdar discussed the gap caused by the benchmarking ordinance.

Member Steichen asked for a list of each program with a brief summary, program, who is operating the program, contractors and San Francisco budget. Energy Watch needed to be added to the acronym list.

Public Comment:

Eddie Ahn, Brightline Defense Project, asked about accessibility to the matrix document.

- 6. Discussion of information gathering, future presentations to the Committee and Committee timeline.** The Committee will discuss information gathering and the Committee's preferred format for how information is provided to them, future presentations and the Committee's timeline. (Attachment: EECC Timeline)

Member Steichen said that she will be unable to attend the next meeting.

The Committee discussed the CCA theme of the August meeting.

The Committee discussed the Committee's invitation to the Economic Opportunity Council to present.

Member Steichen discussed hearing more from the public from groups such as homeowners or business owners.

The Committee discussed information about small businesses that have been collected by surveys.

Member Zouzounis discussed bringing the questions to the SF Apartment Association, SF Chamber of Commerce, Small Business Commission, SF Council of District Merchant Associations and the California Housing Partnership.

Member Jamdar suggested using the September meeting to begin synthesizing the information that has been collected to date.

Public Comment:

Eddie Ahn, Brightline Defense Project, discussed incorporating workforce issues and service providers.

## **7. Public comment**

There was no public comment.

**8. Adjournment.** The meeting was adjourned at 4:58 p.m.

*The next meeting of the Energy Efficiency Coordinating Committee is Monday, August 15, 2016 at 3:00 p.m. in City Hall, Room 421, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102.*

Copies of explanatory documents are available at (1) the Committee's office, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, California, 94103 between the hours of 9 a.m. and 5 p.m., Photo identification is required for entry to the building. (2) on the Committee's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/eecc>; (3) upon request to the Commission Affairs Manager, at telephone number 415-355-3709, or via e-mail at [anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org](mailto:anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org) within three business days of a meeting. If any materials related to an item on this agenda have been distributed to the Commission after distribution of the agenda packet, those materials are available for public inspection at the Department of the Environment, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 during normal office hours or will be made available on the Committee's website <http://www.sfenvironment.org/eecc> as attachments to the agenda or meeting minutes.

**Important Information**

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

NOTE: Persons unable to attend the meeting may submit to the Committee, by the time the meeting begin, written comments. These comments will be made a part of the official public record and shall be brought to the attention of the Committee members. Any written comments should be sent to: Commission Affairs Manager, 1455 Market Street, Suite 1200, San Francisco, CA 94103 by 5:00 p.m. on the day prior to the meeting. Comments that cannot be delivered to the Commission Affairs Manager by that time may be taken directly to the meeting at the location above. When bringing handouts to meetings, please photocopy on both sides of the paper and try to use post-consumer recycled or tree-free paper. Also, please bring sufficient copies of handouts for the Committee, the Commission Affairs Manager and the public.

**Public Comment**

At this time, members of the public may address the Committee on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Committee but are not on today's agenda. Public comment will be taken following each agendized item. Each member of the public may address the Committee for up to three minutes, unless otherwise announced by the President. If it is demonstrated that the comments by the public will exceed 15 minutes, the President may continue Public Comment to another time during the meeting.

The Brown Act forbids the Committee from taking action or discussing any item or issue not appearing on the posted agenda. This rule applies to issues raised in public comment as well. In response to public comment, not on an agendized item, the Committee is limited to:

1. Briefly responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public, or
2. Request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting, or
3. Directing staff to place the item or issue on a future agenda (Government Code Section 54954.2(a).)

**Disability Access**

The Energy Efficiency Coordinating Committee will be held at City Hall, Room 421 in the Civic Center Area. The Committee meeting room is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station at United Nations Plaza and Market Street. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #71 Haight/Noriega and the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the Metro Stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For information about MUNI accessible services call (415) 923-6142. There is accessible curbside parking adjacent to City Hall on Grove Street and Van Ness Avenue and in the vicinity of the Veterans Building at 401 Van Ness Avenue adjacent to Davies Hall and the War Memorial Complex.

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these

individuals. Individuals with chemical sensitivity or related disabilities should call the Mayor's Office on Disability at (415) 554-6789 or (415) 554-6799 (TTY) for additional information.

The following services are available on request 72 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week: For American sign language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact Anthony Valdez at (415) 355-3709 to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

### **Language Access**

Language Assistance: To request an interpreter for a specific item during the meeting, please contact the Commission Affairs Manager, Anthony Valdez, at (415) 355-3709 or [anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org](mailto:anthony.e.valdez@sfgov.org) at least 48 hours in advance of the hearing.

### **Know your Rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, Sunshine Task Force Administrator, City Hall, Room 409, One Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683 at Phone No.: (415) 554-7724; Fax No.: (415) 554-7854; E-mail: [sotf@sfgov.org](mailto:sotf@sfgov.org). Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at [www.sfgov.org](http://www.sfgov.org).

### **Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements**

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code §2.100, et. seq] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at: 25 Van Ness Avenue, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, San Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112, web site at [www.sfgov.org/ethics](http://www.sfgov.org/ethics).

Anthony Valdez, Commission Affairs Manager  
TEL: (415) 355-3709; FAX: (415) 554-6393

Posted: August 12, 2016